

Tentative Agenda  
Finance Committee  
July 12, 2016  
6:00 p.m.  
Council Chambers Conference Room

Roll Call

DISCUSSION ITEMS

- 1) Continued EMS Market Wage Adjustment Discussion  
Doug Jones, Emergency Medical Services Director
- 2) Mowing and Nuisance Abatement Contractor  
Ray Haydaripoor, Acting Development & Public Affairs Director

ADJOURNMENT



**FINANCE DIRECTOR'S OFFICE**

10000 EAST 59<sup>TH</sup> STREET

RAYTOWN, MISSOURI 64133-3993

PHONE: 816-737-6084 - FAX: 816-737-8370

E-MAIL: MARKL@RAYTOWN.MO.US

**MEMORANDUM**

**Date:** July 8, 2016

**To:** Finance Committee

**From:** Mark Loughry, Interim City Administrator

**Re:** EMS Wage Adjustment

I have reviewed the proposal for wage adjustments and scanned the City budget looking for ideas on how we would fund this going forward. Based on the current proposal of an 18% adjustment across the board for the paramedics and EMT's we would need to reduce spending or increase revenue by approximately \$155,000.00 to offset this increased cost.

Currently, the City is experiencing relatively flat revenue streams overall. I believe the only way to meet the goal of offsetting this increase would be a reduction of 1.1% to all department budgets in the General Fund. Even with that, there will likely be the need for additional cuts given the increases related to operating costs outside staff control. This also does not take into consideration any raises that might be considered during the budget process. With the increased expenses in other areas and the potential for other increases I am not confident we can cut other budgets enough to cover the proposed increase without a reduction in services elsewhere.

In my opinion, with the current resources, there is no way for the proposed increase to be net neutral to the City; therefore, the only way this proposal would be sustainable is some type of new or increased cash flows. Given that the last time we increased fees for service we saw no increase in revenues I do not believe that is a viable solution. That leaves us with attempting to implement a dedicated tax for EMS services. I am not sure what the climate for a dedicated EMS tax would be.

As I mentioned last week there are other communities that run EMS services as either private contracts, as part of their fire services or as a self-sufficient enterprise fund. While I understand we have an immediate need, I think it would be prudent to explore what other options are available to the City either prior to or as part of implementing any long-term wage adjustments.

## IAFF LOCAL 1730 FINANCIAL PROPOSAL: RAYTOWN EMS DEPARTMENT-2016

The goal of this proposal is to address financial obstacles currently having a negative effect on the Raytown EMS Department's ability to recruit and retain employees and its ability to operate at an acceptable level while not jeopardizing employee morale and financial stability, public safety, or create contentious working relationships with neighboring public safety departments.

### **EXPLANATION OF PROPOSAL:**

The financial situation regarding wages and staffing within the Raytown EMS department is one that Local 1730 has been voicing our concerns with for several years. Our memberships' concern and dissatisfaction with the current levels of wages and staffing are multifaceted and are now having a direct and measurable negative impact on several levels within the Raytown EMS department. After several years of attempting to resolve this situation with the City unsuccessfully, representatives of Local 1730 began doing more extensive research into similar organizations with the intent of utilizing some of their more successful practices to bring about positive change at the financial level. In conducting this research and consulting with similar organizations in size and population, we have discovered that the task of resolving the financial hurdles of Raytown EMS will be challenging. A significant increase in funds to the EMS departments budget will be a key factor in bringing about a sustainable resolution to the departments current operations.

As part of our researching a way to resolve these financial difficulties, we attempted to contact EMS agencies throughout the state and identify their approaches to wages, staffing, etc.. It became clear the model of an EMS service operated as its own department within a local city government is one that is scarcely being used. This led us to contact a representative of the state who could provide us with a more accurate list of agencies we could contact for information. The state advised us that of the more than 215 ambulance services throughout the state, there were less than 5 that they could readily recall that operated this model. Of the few services provided, all of them had populations of 5500 or less. In further researching these services, their call volumes averaged 100 calls or less per month. These services also utilize between 8 and 12 full time employees. The conclusions that can be drawn from this information are very telling to our membership. The model utilized by the City and Raytown EMS is not only one that is rarely used, but also when it is used is mostly utilized in areas with smaller populations, and lower call volumes. Even more concerning is the fact that these services, in spite of their lower call volumes and population, have nearly the same number of employees as Raytown EMS.

Further investigation has also shown us that Raytown EMS's wages and compensation for its full time employee's is among the lowest in the region. We sent requests for wage and hourly compensation scales out to the other agencies who provide emergency ambulance services within the region to compare them to the current rates of the Raytown EMS employees. These agencies utilized a range of schedules and deployment models, several of them similar to or the same as those used by Raytown EMS. We received a considerable number of responses while there were also a few agencies who did not respond to our request for information. Of the agencies who provided information, we were able to take the lowest and highest starting wage for each front line position within Raytown EMS (EMT-B, and EMT-Paramedic) and compare them to those of the responding agencies. For an EMT-B the lowest starting wage provided was

\$10.15 hourly with the highest starting wage being \$14.68 hourly. For EMT-Paramedic the lowest starting wage provided was \$12.50 hourly, the highest starting wage being \$16.50 hourly. These wage comparisons indicate that Raytown EMS is well below the regional standard wages for these positions. Raytown EMS's current highest wage for EMT-B with 9 (nine) years of employment in the EMS department is at \$10.71 hourly, and their lowest paid EMT-B with 1.5 years of employment is at \$9.15 hourly. Raytown EMS's current lowest paid Paramedic is at \$10.77 hourly with 1.5 years of employment, and their highest paid Paramedic at \$13.56 hourly with 12 years of employment. The progression of wages throughout a member's employment with Raytown EMS is also in obvious contrast to the other services within the region. The obvious conclusion that can be drawn from this information is that Raytown EMS's current levels of compensation place its employees in the position of making a below industry standard wage when beginning their employment, and after many years of service they continue receiving wages that are at or below the starting wages of similar services within the region.

The lower levels of compensation and staffing have created a sort of ripple effect, causing other aspects of the service to suffer as a result. Because the compensation levels are such that they cannot compete with neighboring agencies, employees who are hired are frequently forced to seek other employment opportunities because they cannot support themselves or their families in the current economy. This is compounded by those employees who leave for other employment telling potential job seekers and other EMS professionals that the compensation rates at Raytown EMS are considerably lower than those they might receive working for another agency. The product of these factors then yields the result of Raytown EMS not only not being unable to retain employees once they are hired, but also not being able to recruit employees because potential employees cannot afford the lower than industry standard wages.

The next level that becomes directly impactful as a result of the departments underfunding, is the frequent utilization of other services to make up for the lower levels of staffing. Raytown EMS currently, at optimum level, utilizes 2 ambulances with 2 employees on each of those ambulances per day. As of this proposal, the current level of staffing at Raytown EMS is a combination of 11 full time EMT-B and Paramedic personnel. This means that at current staffing, the service is already below the necessary number to run the service without having to hire over time to fill a position. On shifts that are fully staffed (4 employees) and are running both ambulances, if any of those employees is not on duty for any reason they are forced to attempt to hire an employee for overtime. If overtime hiring is unsuccessful then the service is forced to shut down one of those ambulances and run the service with one ambulance until such time they can hire another employee in or until the next shift begins. We began independently tracking the occurrences of Raytown EMS shutting down an ambulance and operating with one at the beginning of 2015. By our count during 2015 the service shut down for various periods of time on at least 80 occasions in 2015. When the service is shut down to 1 ambulance, they are put in a position where they must frequently call for mutual aid from other agencies to make certain citizens are receiving an ambulance in a reasonable amount of time. The agency most often called upon for aid is the Kansas City Fire Department. According to KCFD's dispatch records, KCFD responded into Raytown for aid over 300 times in 2015. While the issue that citizens are being charged more when KCFD comes in to transport citizens after discounts are applied by Raytown EMS for its own citizens is very troubling...it is the contention of our Local that this is not only an unsustainable practice, but that it is a potential public safety issue. With staffing at lower levels and the EMS Department unable to fully man and staff the necessary number of units, other units have had to respond to Raytown from up to 10 miles away increasing the time a citizen must wait for an EMS transport to a hospital.

While the lack of staffing for two ambulances to operate per day is a very serious issue, we are now faced with the reality of an increasing call volume that is further taxing the existing resources even on days that the service is operating at full staffing for the shift. As call volumes have increased over the past several years, the two ambulance system in Raytown has shown to be increasingly inadequate during moderate to higher volume periods. There have already been 24 hour shifts this year in which both ambulances were fully manned for the shift and the service still had to mutual aid multiple calls because 2 ambulances constantly running were not enough to handle the call volume. As call volumes throughout the state have continued to rise since the implementation of the Affordable Care Act and population has steadily increased through the metro area, it is reasonable to expect the call volume for Raytown EMS will at least remain at its current levels if not continue to gradually increase over the next 5 years.

**PROPOSED RESOLUTION:**

For the reasons stated above Local 1730 is proposing the following changes be made and implemented by January 1, 2017:

1.) The wage scale shown here will be made effective immediately upon the signing of the MOU under negotiation. Members hourly wages will change to reflect their current years of service in accordance with this scale. Members will continue to progress through each level of this scale and receive the associated increase on the anniversary of their hire date until year 11. In year 11 and on each hire date anniversary following year 11, members shall receive a lump sum of \$1000.00 paid on the first pay date following the members date of hire anniversary.

We calculate that the implementation of these changes will require an additional \$98,500 in funding.

EMT	Hourly
0	10.40
1	10.80
2	11.20
3	11.60
4	12.00
5	12.40
6	12.80
7	13.20
8	13.60
9	14.00
10	14.40
11 or higher	Lump Sum
Medic	Hourly
0	12.55
1	13.00
2	13.45
3	13.90
4	14.35
5	14.80
6	15.25
7	15.70
8	16.15
9	16.60
10	17.05
11 or higher	Lump Sum

By allowing employee's to top out in pay in 10 years, the employee is guaranteed increases in pay for the first portion of their career. By the end of the first 10 years of an employee's career, although they will have completed the pay scale steps they will also have been vested in the pension system and be making a reasonable wage. Additionally, employee's will have to consider the loss in wages that would occur should they seek employment opportunities elsewhere. For these reasons, employees are more likely to select Raytown EMS as a long term career option as opposed to a part time or short term job or "stepping stone".

2.) The City will fill the current vacancies in staffing bringing them to a full and optimum operational level according to their current budget and operations (13 front line personnel). Additionally the the City will make available the funds necessary to add 6 new positions to be opened for filling to qualified candidates by January 1, 2017. The department would be capable of making these changes at an operational level immediately as they already have a 3rd ambulance available currently being utilized as a backup. If the employees are divided by qualification equally (3 EMT-B & 3 EMT-Paramedic) and the proposed pay scale is utilized, this would equate to an additional \$229,132.80 in funding. This figure does not include the cost of benefits, only wages.

TOTAL PROPOSED ADDITIONAL FUNDING: **\$327,632.80**

#### CONCLUSION:

The items discussed in this proposal are all based upon real data collected during extensive research into the current situation the members of Local 1730 and the Raytown EMS department are facing. We hope that you will note that at no time have we made the argument or suggested that our members “deserve”, or have “earned” the proposed implementations. While our membership know that they have done both of those, this proposal is meant to bring our members as well as the EMS Department as a whole up to an acceptable level and the industry norm. Our membership realize that the figures presented mean a significant increase in funds to the EMS Department. We would ask that you bare in mind while considering these changes that these figures will not place these members in the upper echelon of their industries earnings or staffing. These changes will only bring them to the level necessary to provide adequate service and that their counterparts at neighboring and regional agencies have been at for some time. It is also the sincere desire of our members to avoid negative impact to other city departments as a result of these changes. Our membership feel strongly that without considerable change in these areas the ability to provide adequate service, staff ambulances, and retain current employees will continue to suffer and result in further negative impact to the City.

We humbly submit this proposal for consideration on behalf of the members of Local 1730. Due to the time sensitive nature of our current negotiations, we would request that a response from the city be sent to the Executive Board of Local 1730 within 10 days of its receipt.



## PAY SCALE EFFECTIVE JANUARY 1, 2016

<b>FF Class 1</b>	<b>Step 1</b>	<b>Step 2</b>	<b>Step 3</b>	<b>Step 4</b>
Annual	\$35,270.10	\$37,021.11	\$38,928.44	\$41,523.68
Monthly	\$2,939.18	\$3,085.09	\$3,244.04	\$3,460.31
Shift	\$289.86	\$304.25	\$319.93	\$341.25
Hourly	\$12.08	\$12.68	\$13.33	\$14.22

<b>FF Class 2</b>	<b>Step 1</b>	<b>Step 2</b>	<b>Step 3</b>	<b>Step 4</b>
Annual	\$42,836.93	\$43,681.17	\$44,775.53	\$45,400.90
Monthly	\$3,569.74	\$3,640.10	\$3,731.29	\$3,783.41
Shift	\$352.05	\$358.98	\$367.98	\$373.12
Hourly	\$14.67	\$14.96	\$15.33	\$15.55

<b>Driver</b>	<b>Step 1</b>	<b>Step 2</b>	<b>Step 3</b>	<b>Step 4</b>	<b>Step 5</b>
Annual	\$47,683.45	\$48,371.33	\$49,590.78	\$50,747.69	\$52,311.08
Monthly	\$3,973.62	\$4,030.94	\$4,132.57	\$4,228.97	\$4,359.26
Shift	\$391.88	\$397.53	\$407.55	\$417.06	\$429.91
Hourly	\$16.33	\$16.56	\$16.98	\$17.38	\$17.91

<b>Captain</b>	<b>Step 1</b>	<b>Step 2</b>	<b>Step 3</b>	<b>Step 4</b>	<b>Step 5</b>
Annual	\$53,843.21	\$55,469.14	\$57,126.33	\$58,814.80	\$60,597.06
Monthly	\$4,486.93	\$4,622.43	\$4,760.53	\$4,901.23	\$5,049.76
Shift	\$442.50	\$455.86	\$469.48	\$483.36	\$498.00
Hourly	\$18.44	\$18.99	\$19.56	\$20.14	\$20.75

*These rates do not include  
2.5% for EMT or  
7.5% for medic.*



## MEMORANDUM

**To:** Finance Committee  
**From:** Ray Haydaripoor  
Acting Director of Development and Public Affairs  
**Date:** July 12, 2016  
**Subject:** Nuisance Abatement Services Performed by Lawn Logic, LLC

This summer of 2016 the Development and Public Affairs Department reached an agreement with Lawn Logic, LLC to provide nuisance abatement services for The City on properties that are found to be in violation of certain nuisances in the Code of Ordinances of the City of Raytown. The services that Lawn Logic provides include mowing of grass and weeds that have grown above eight (8) inches in height, removal of yard waste and removal of some trash and debris items. Since Lawn Logic began working as one of the three nuisance abatement contractors for the Development and Public Affairs department they have shown to provide quality of work that meet our expectations. Lawn Logic has quickly developed a relationship with Staff as a company dedicated to professionalism and prompt service response time. A few of the additional benefits working with Lawn Logic provides are as follows:

- High quality of work performed; issued work orders rarely, if ever, need to be re-issued for the same violation.
- Prompt response time to issued work orders, performing the work within 24 to 72 hours of receiving the work order.
- Timely and organized invoice billing, with documentation and photos showing work completed at each address where a work order was issued.
- The owner of Lawn Logic, David Hellums, has shown exemplary professionalism and a commitment to providing quality service.
- Lawn Logic is owned and operated out of Raytown, providing the City the opportunity to support a local business (one of the other nuisance abatement contractors, Construction and Abatement Services, is also based out of Raytown).

**Chart 1** below outlines the average cost of service provided for each of the three nuisance abatement contractors currently performing work for the Development and Public Affairs Department:

Nuisance Abatement Contractor	Average Cost of Service
<b>Lawn Logic, LLC</b>	<b>\$119.88</b>
<b>Crosscutters</b>	<b>\$92.29</b>
<b>Construction and Abatement Services</b>	<b>\$75.29</b>

The current service pricing Lawn Logic charges to the City of Raytown are the highest among the three nuisance abatement contractors this year; however, it is the opinion of Staff that both the quality of work performed and the reliability provided by Lawn Logic exceed that of the other two contractors, compensating for the higher cost of service. It is therefore the opinion of Staff that Lawn Logic, LLC provides the preferred value of service to the City for nuisance abatement.

